

CRCPL SITE IMPROVEMENT PROJECT

| | | | |
|-----------------|--|--------|--------------|
| Date: | December 23, 2021 | | |
| Project number: | 21301.01 | | |
| Location: | Chillicothe, Ohio | | |
| Prepared By: | Matt Leasure, Nic Sanna Designing Local Landscape Architecture (DLLA) | | |
| Email: | matt@designinglocal.com, nic@designinglocal.com | Phone: | 614-893-7178 |

Dear Mr. James Hill,

On Wednesday December 15th, 2021 quotes for CRCPL Library Site Improvements Project - Northside Branch and CRCPL Library Site Improvements Project - Kingston Branch were opened and read aloud. There were two (2) total quotes that were received and accepted. One company provided quotes via email for all three projects (Main Library, Northside Branch, Kingston Branch), but this quote was incomplete and was not accepted.

1. NORTHSIDE BRANCH RECOMMENDATION

Two alternates were included in the project to provide flexibility in managing final costs and award or rejection of the alternate(s) will not affect the selection of the low quote contractor is for the project. The Bid Tabulation is included in item 1.7. The lowest cost quote was submitted by Rhoads Landscaping Inc. (RLI) of Circleville, Ohio.

- 1.1. **Scope Review Discussion.** DLLA conducted a project scope review with Rhoads Construction and believe their quote to be responsive and complete. RLI demonstrated a thorough knowledge of the plans and the expected processes to complete a quality project. We are confident in RLI's understanding of the existing site and layout and design of the proposed project.
- 1.2. **References.** DLLA contacted three provided references: T&R Properties, Frontier Community Services, and Circleville Hospitality Inn. DLLA received a return call on December 23, 2021 from Todd Valentine of Frontier Community Services and spoke to him briefly. Mr. Valentine spoke highly of RLI and has utilized RLI for multiple projects. He has recommended using RLI to multiple other businesses and family members. Based upon this reference, DLLA feels comfortable with the quality of RLI's work.
- 1.3. **Quote for Base Project. \$96,635.00**
 - 1.3.1. **Base Project Scope.** Base bid includes construction of a fenced children's reading garden at the southeast corner of the existing library, demolition of existing dumpster enclosure, concrete work, landscape planting, and other various items required as per plans.
 - 1.3.2. **Recommendation: Accept this Quote for the Base Project.**
- 1.4. **Quote for Alternate #1, North Pergola. \$65,955.00**
 - 1.4.1. **Alternate #1 Scope.** Timber pergola and brick patio modifications per plan.
 - 1.4.2. **Recommendation: Accept this Quote for Alternate #1.**
- 1.5. **Quote for Alternate #2, South Lawn Earthwork. \$35,200.00**
 - 1.5.1. **Alternate 2 Scope.** Imported soils and other earthwork for south lawn.
 - 1.5.2. **Recommendation: Do not accept this quote for Alternate 2.** With the high bid amount and associated work required for this alternate we are not recommending this work be completed at this time. If CRCPL is

interested in further pursuing Alternate 2, DLLA is willing to work with RLI to determine methods for reducing the cost of this scope of work. RLI would then submit a revised quote for this scope to be accepted at the discretion of CRCPL.

1.6. **Summary.** We recommend awarding the Contract for the Northside Branch project for the Base Project and Alternate amount of \$162,590.00 to Rhoads Landscaping Inc.

1.7. **Bid Tabulation.**

| Bidder | Base Bid | Alternate #1 North Pergola | Alternate #2 South Earthwork |
|---------------------------------|--------------|-------------------------------|---------------------------------|
| Rhoads Landscaping Inc. | \$96,635.00 | \$65,955.00 | \$35,200.00 |
| Detillion Landscaping Co., Inc. | \$213,131.00 | \$77,250.00 | \$33,000.00 |

2. KINGSTON BRANCH RECOMMENDATION.

One alternate was included in the project to provide flexibility in managing final costs and award or rejection of the alternate will not affect the selection of the low quote contractor is for the project. The Bid Tabulation is included in item 2.6. The lowest cost quote was submitted by Rhoads Landscaping Inc. (RLI) of Circleville, Ohio.

2.1. **Scope Review Discussion.** DLLA briefly addressed the scope review for Kingston Branch and believe the provided quote is responsive and complete. See item 1.1 for additional information.

2.2. **References.** See Item 1.2.

2.3. **Quote for Base Project. \$95,735.00**

2.3.1. **Base Bid Scope.** Base bid includes construction of a brick paver plaza, site amenities, and plantings.

2.3.2. **Recommendation: Accept this Base Bid with modifications at CRCPL discretion.** RLI's submitted quote is approximately 18% over DLLA's Opinion of Probable Construction Cost. While this is relatively high, DLLA acknowledges the highly variable bidding climate and feels that this quote is within reason. Additionally, DLLA has seen other recent projects be accepted by public entities with high variations between design estimates and bids/quotes. If CRCPL would like to minimize the cost, some parts of the project could be non-performed during the construction process and discounted from the final construction fee. For example, the two Canopy Benches (AK3) in the west lawn area could be non-performed, removing approximately \$5-8,000 from the cost.

2.4. **Alternate #1 South Canopy. \$15,115.00**

2.4.1. **Alternate #1 Scope.** Entry door cantilevered arbor and related work.

2.4.2. **Recommendation: Accept this Alternate #1**

2.5. **Summary.** We recommend awarding the Contract for the Kingston Branch project for the Base Project and Alternate amount of \$110,850.00 to Rhoads Landscaping Inc. If desired by CRCPL, the final construction cost can be reduced through the methods described in item 2.3.2.

2.6. **Bid Tabulation:**

| Bidder | Base Bid | Alternate #1 South Canopy | |
|---------------------------------|--------------|------------------------------|--|
| Rhoads Landscaping Inc. | \$95,735.00 | \$15,115.00 | |
| Detillion Landscaping Co., Inc. | \$134,715.00 | \$20,564.00 | |